

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

The Town of Bethel Planning Board held a Work Session on July 10, 2012 at 7 PM at the Duggan School, 3460 State Route 55, White Lake. A regular meeting of the Planning Board followed on the same date at 7:30 PM. On the agenda at this time was the following:

In attendance: Daniel Gettel, Chairman, Bill Brey, Vice Chairman, Susan Brown Otto, Steve Simpson, David Biren, Michael Cassaro, Wilfred Hughson, Vicky Vassmer-Simpson, Councilwoman, BJ Gettel, Code Enforcement Officer, Jacqueline Ricianni, Attorney, Michael Weeks, Engineer, and Jannetta MacArthur – Recording Secretary

David Slater – Alternate arrived 8:05 pm

Pledge to the flag

Motion to approve minutes from the June 12, 2012 meeting by Steve Simpson, second by Bill Brey

All in favor-7

Opposed -0

Agreed and carried

Daniel Gettel: Jacy is there any old business we should discuss? We did hear back from Steve Dubrovsky. We asked him as a courtesy to let us know in 6 months about the status of the project. Basically the letter said they are still in litigation, so there isn't much they can do. They have another 6 months, but I did ask him to let us know after 6 months.

Jannetta MacArthur: What project is this?

Daniel Gettel: That was the Preserve at Chapin Estates. He did get back to us.

Jacqueline Ricciani: This isn't on the agenda, but in case anyone hasn't heard with respect to the Boymelgreen project, the last time I reported that the judge had made a decision in favor of the Plaintiff's. Boymelgreen filed a notice of appeal last Friday, or this Monday, that they will be appealing. The judge scheduled a conference tomorrow. This boards' position has been that the application is on hold until all the litigation is done. If that should change, I will let you know. For right now, it will be a while.

Daniel Gettel: As far as deadlines for approvals go, they already waived their deadlines.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Exactly. They waived all their time requirements.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

1) Application for a Hotel/Spa, 1623 State Route 17B, White Lake, known as Bethel Tax Map #: 33-5-2.1, White Lake Mansion, LLC. (Sudol)

Jess Sudol: I am the architect for the White Lake Mansion, Spa and Resort, which this board now has seen a few times over the past few months, at least once this year. What I would like to do is quickly go over the project description and briefly give you an update of where we have been the last 3 months, since we have been here last, to tell you where we plan on going from here, as far as the schedule is concerned, and then open it up to any questions that the board or town staff might have. For starters, as previously said, it is a construction of a new mansion building which will be a replica of the current building that is on-site. We plan on matching it in the architectural style, size, etc. There are also two additional buildings to be built in the back of the parcel. We refer to them as building A and B. They will be hotel style buildings and they will each have 36 suite style rooms. I say that because they each will have a little kitchenette in them. In Building A, which is the western building, the lowest level will have a garage. It will actually be a parking garage. The lower level in building B will have the Spa. That roughly encompasses 15,000 square feet. Then there is space set aside for mechanical rooms. The intention of the developer is to build this entire project as a single phase project. I know that was one of the comments that have come through. We will probably be looking for separate CO's. I know we are jumping ahead a little bit, but it will be built all at once. That is the point that I want to make. We are not going to build one building, try to sell it, then go build another building. Because of the site here and moving around; we are going to have to do it all once.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Jess, if I could just interrupt you before you go on. Each building, A and B, is going to have 36 suites. How many people can a suite accommodate?

Jess Sudol: Two to three.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Will you be able to provide us with the maximum number of occupants per building?

Jess Sudol: Absolutely.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Do you do that now?

Daniel Gettel: There is a sewer report floating around for the Town Board. That will be done by room.

Jess Sudol: I can get my calculator out at the end of the meeting and figure it out for you. Anyway, one of the things I wanted to talk about is how this whole facility is going to function. I know there were questions asked, will it be open to the public, is it a day spa, is it a health spa. I wanted to add some clarity to that. It is based on fractional ownership. The developer, White Lake Mansion LLC., is going to own the entire parcel, the site, and ultimately they are going to own the Mansion Building, which will have offices, a small retail component, a restaurant, and a banquet hall and a small bar. They will also own the spa and the common space, all the parking areas and so on. Each one of the units, similar to a

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

time-share, will be sold off basically. The reason that they are doing that and the way the program is set up at that it is really a health spa. It is not a day spa, it is not a place where someone will get their nails done, pedicure, and their hair done. It is more of a situation where doctors from either New York City, or locally like Middletown, or Crystal Run, will be buying some of these rooms, the majority of them, and they can prescribe their patients to come to White Lake Mansion for a week to eat right, to exercise, to do various things. They will also have other procedures that can be done in the spa. Basically, the insurance will reimburse the doctors at the end of the day. That might make up 40% to 50% of the ownership. The entire ownership is open to the public. If one of us says, we want to buy all the rooms, or we want to buy one room for one month, we would have the ability to do that. But the main market that is driving the project is having the doctors involved with the health spa, not a day spa. Now the offices in the Mansion Building are going to be offices for staff that work for the developer, whether it is answering the phone, whether it is reception, whether it is maintenance. It is not going to be outside offices. It is strictly for people working at the spa. A very small retail component is going to have some shirts, hats; mugs that say something like White Lake Mansion. It is not going to be a separate retail component or a separate store where someone can come in. The restaurant is the one main piece that will be open to the public on a regular basis. The banquet hall, all the meeting rooms are for larger groups that will come to the facility, they can all gather there, eat their breakfast, lunch, dinner as a group, similar to other resorts in the Catskill Region. Again, 90% of the entire project is really focused toward the people staying there. It is not to say if you want to come to the health spa for a day, you wouldn't be able to do that, but it is really going to be geared for a people staying there for a week. That is what the target and the driving force is behind the project. I just wanted to talk a bit about that, I know I didn't hit on it in that much in detail in previous meetings, but I thought that it would be worth mentioning. As far as where we are since the last meeting, we started the SEQRA process. As I first stood before this board, we are not coming in with a concept plan asking to be approved in a month. We know better than that, we know it is a lengthy process. We completed the short form. The Planning Board is going to be lead agency. The NYS DOT needs to issue a permit for the entrance, the Health Department will issue a permit for the wells that are on site, and the DEC ultimately issues a permit for the storm water prevention plan. The other thing we talked about was the sanitary sewer district extension. If you recall there is a district line to the Kauneonga Lake Sewer District that comes through here (showing on the map) that doesn't include these two buildings (A & B) that is because historically there was a zoning line here. The district followed the zoning line. The parcel was brought into the 17B zoning district, but the sewer district got left behind. We are well on our way with that process. I believe there is a meeting tomorrow night and that there is a resolution that will be voted on. The big thing that came out of that was that the engineer for the sewer department came back and said this project, based on what we are proposing, is not going to be a capacity issue for the district. That is really what we are getting at. The rest of the stuff is more of moving paper around. We also received our height variance from The Zoning Board of Appeals for building B. If you recall there were a bunch of old variances left over from a previous application. We had two of those variances applied to the Mansion Building and building A. What we had to do was cleanup building B, which is the same as building A, as far as height and size go. We are here to report it is all complete. We have our variance so we can move on from there. We have completed our design plans, and design submissions. That is actually what everyone has in front of them. I have included project details, signage, lighting, and things like that. Fencing, and landscaping, to shield those cars from the people driving down 17B, so it

Town of Bethel Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

has the same effect as it does now. I wanted to talk to you briefly about what we call sustainable items that we incorporated in the plan, which is kind of a catchword these days. One of the things we are going to do is have cisterns in the basements or here by the spa, for any water from the roof. We would reuse that for irrigation. There is potential we could use gray water in the building itself, that is a lot more complicated. I don't think we are going to get too much into that, but we are certainly going to use rain water for irrigation and we may use it to supplement for our fire supply, for the sprinkler system, which is a little more complicated. We are not sure we are going to that yet. For now it will just be used for irrigation. You can see all of the landscaping we have in the courtyard area. We are also going to be using LED lighting fixtures in the parking lots and in the area lighting. LED is newer technology. It is a little more expensive, but as many of you know it is a lot more sustainable. It has a lot longer light life. One of the reasons why our developer chose to go that route, again, as I mentioned before, is that he intends on owning the project. He's not going to build it and then sell it to somebody. He is going to be around, and his kids are going to be around long enough to really feel the impact of some of these sustainable features. We are also using a variety of storm water treatment including a rain garden where the Mansion building roof runoff will go down, be filtered in the rain garden. We are also using a bio retention area. Basically, they are built in practices for storm water. Instead of a big pond going out into the street it comes in, then filters through some sand and stone mixture, and then it discharges off the site. The filtering process takes away phosphorus, nitrates, and other things in storm water. It is pretty much a new thing in storm water design. We did look into pervious pavement. One of the issues we had with pervious pavement is this whole back hill site is on bedrock, and for pervious pavement to work it is only as good as what is underneath it. If you had Long Island type sandy soil for four or five feet that water could go through the pervious pavement, through the stone, and percolate into the ground. It works really well. Unfortunately, based on our information, that wouldn't be applicable here. But, we are going to be filtering all of our storm water one way or another, so we are going to be treating the water. Again, we are going to be having extensive landscaping. We are going to be preserving some of the trees on the perimeter and have trees along our parking lot, to keep as much shade as possible. One thing that was pointed out in the planning board engineer's comments is there are a couple of areas around the parking lot where there aren't any trees. We do intend on putting them in there. The big thing that has always been for this project, and any project on the 17B corridor, is traffic. How does this impact traffic? We talked about this a little bit the last time. We went back and did a traffic impact analysis. We did studies on the Route 17B corridor. We took traffic counts. What that allowed us to do, by counting the traffic ourselves and looking at the Router 17B corridor study, which is actually very comprehensive, is it allowed us to see what our ratios were to compare traffic in May, to traffic in June, to traffic in August, to traffic in November. We were able to establish ratios based on when we counted it to look at all those different scenarios, which was something that was asked of us. There were two things I was very surprised to see personally. One was the events at Bethel Woods were not the bigger contributor to the traffic in the 17B corridor. I thought for sure that it would be it. Actually the bigger contributor of local traffic is the Boy Scout Camps. When everyone comes in for the weekend or when they have parents weekend. That is when those numbers spike. Again, I have been around the area my entire life and I never even thought of that. That is actually one of the things that came out of the Route 17B corridor study. Bethel Woods events do contribute to the traffic problems up and down this whole corridor. There are a handful of those events during the summer, when there are also the Boy Scout weekends. Those are where you really see the traffic issues. Basically from September thru May, traffic

Town of Bethel Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

goes fine, we don't contribute to it, but traffic gets pretty bad when those events happen. We found our project is a relatively small project in comparison to those traffic volumes, and our traffic is operating off peak. I don't want to get into every little detail, because the NYS Department of Transportation will be reviewing this as part of our permit and they won't give us a permit until they are satisfied with our study, but I wanted to talk about a few of the things that we found. Basically when traffic is good, we don't make it bad, when traffic's bad, it's already bad, and we don't make it much worse. One of the important things we did do that was not part of the plan that you had seen in the past, was put this access out to Route 55. It is somewhat of a relief valve, so when things are really congested on Route 17B, those who know the local area and how to get to New York City an alternate way, can sneak out this way, and down Route 55 to Route 84, whichever way they choose to go. They don't have to go on Route 17B, like they would have had to on the old plan. We met with the fire department last night, which went very well. They had a lot of suggestions that we intend to incorporate in our plans. One of the things we did was show them that we took our virtual computer program and took a fire truck and drove it through the whole site, just to demonstrate to them the site had accessibility and they could drive around the whole thing. There aren't going to be any pinch points. Actually, when we ran the simulation there were some pinch points, so we adjusted our design to make sure we had a big enough radius when we swept through, so there wouldn't be any issues. A couple of things that they mentioned that we will be including in the project are the gated areas. We have a portion of the parking lot gated from 9 at night to 6 in the morning. We are going to give them cards, the same ones the people at the resort will have, so that if there is a fire they can just swipe their card and the gates will open like they would for anyone else. We also talked about making a couple of these sidewalks a little bit wider and dropping some curbs along the pavement, which has worked in the past. If they really get into an emergency situation they could drive their vehicle up on the sidewalk. It is easy for us to make that accommodation, to make the sidewalk a couple of feet wider. Specifically in this area (showing on map), instead of having a 6 foot sidewalk, we will have an 8 foot sidewalk. Instead of having a full 6 inch curb we will drop the curb down to flush, so they will be able to drive up there. (That is the courtyard between buildings A and B). One other interesting thing that came up during that meeting, we are talking to our client, the developers about this, is allowing the fire department to actually use the building for some future training and drills, until such time the project is underway and it is demolished. It isn't really something to do with this board, but I thought it was important for you to know that our owner is trying to cooperate with everyone he can.

Daniel Gettel: They don't want to burn the building, they want to repel out the windows.

Jess Sudol: We also had a chance to meet with Mr. Weeks, the planning board engineer, to go through his comments. There are some that are very easy for us to address, there are also some that are more significant. One of the big ones has to do with the roof runoff. Basically what we did was state that all of the roof runoff would go into these cisterns for irrigation, which it is going to. Therefore, it isn't.... we don't have to pump water here into our fire retention area. The reality of it is that when we get the big storms, unless we put in the biggest cistern that has ever been built, it is going to exceed that and hit the overflow. The design overflow is when it goes to a certain point, runs off into the storm sewer system. In order to account for that, we met with our engineers and we are going to put in an underground chamber system in this portion of the parking lot right next to the building to hold back the

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

additional water that's coming off the building (west of bldg A). These are the types of things we will be responding to in detail, in writing, with our plans addressing these comments. None of the comments would impact the layout. We may add a dumpster enclosure here or there. Somehow, when we counted the parking spots we missed one parking spot so we are going to add a parking spot right here (showing on map). We are not going to be moving buildings around. We are not going to be moving them up the hill or down the hill, changing the site or anything like that. No substantial changes whatsoever. I will provide written responses to Mr. Weeks' comments in a timely fashion, so it correlates with everything we have to do from here. Speaking of which, where do we go from here. The intent for tonight's meetings isn't to ask for an approval of any kind but to give an update to the board so we can start to talk about the future steps, such as to schedule a public hearing, and hear what the public's comments are. In order to do that we have to send out mailings, hear what their comments are. Just like we do with the town staff, the town engineer, and the fire department, we will take those comments from the public and, if we can, address them in a sensible manner. We will absolutely do that as part of the process. That is part of the SEQRA process. At no point have we ever tried to hide from anyone's comments. We have done what is right and what is required of us. Once we get to the public hearing, we are still targeting a construction start as soon as we can, ideally we would like to start in the fall. We have a lot of earth work and rock removal to do. We would like to work through the winter, the financing is lined up the way it should. We can move dirt in the winter, start building our building in the spring, and then have it closed it up for next winter if everything goes according to plan. That is the perfect world schedule we are targeting right now. That is where we are right now. I know I am providing a lot of information in a short time, but wanted to get through as much as we could and open it up for questions.

Daniel Gettel: I have a couple of notes. You mentioned lead agency, I spoke to you about this a while ago. We declared our intent to be lead agent 2 months ago. There is a timetable that goes along with that. There are 62 days that we have to act on that, I believe. Am I wrong? You are setting the timetable by your submissions, but there are deadlines that we have to meet with SEQRA. We had discussed this and you had stated that you would be okay waiving any timetable requirement, since you are controlling the submissions.

Jess Sudol: No, providing it's not anything.....

Daniel Gettel: No, it's not going to be drastic, but there is a 62 day requirement. We don't have the information to respond, I don't want to be held to the 62 days. We had that discussion. I just want to make sure it is on the record. As far as the fire department, I did have a chance to go to the meeting last evening. They did suggest a dry hydrant on the property. If the State will actually allow you to cross 17B, which would probably be a good idea, I don't want to speak for the board, but I think everyone on the board would agree that a dry hydrant, in case there is an emergency, would be a good idea. You wouldn't have to close down 17B to get the hoses across.

Jess Sudol: We will agree to put the dry hydrant in.

Daniel Gettel: The DOT has to approve it; the fire department has to approve an easement to the lake.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

There are other items involved. It is something we would like you to pursue. In all fairness to the board, I didn't have BJ forward Michael (Weeks') review comments to the board. Most of it was technical in nature.

Michael Weeks: Most of them were minor in nature. A couple of the bigger comments, one is the SWPPP plan, the other, I think, is that we need to see a geotechnical report. They did do borings. We need a report to back up that up. There will be blasting. Those are my two biggest comments. Jess talked about dumpsters, loading areas, if we get some of this cleaned up, we can then talk about my comments.

BJ Gettel: If any wishes a copy...

Daniel Gettel: Have you met with the State DOT?

Jess Sudol: Not face to face with the State DOT. I have spoken with their local representative in Monticello, and the regional representative in Binghamton.

Daniel Gettel: You are comfortable with the entrances as is? Also, with the access on Route 55?

Michael Weeks: Route 55 is through the county.

Jess Sudol: We haven't started the permit yet. I am confident with our proposed access on Route 17B, because we have been out there and we have studied it, and because of the dips in the road, anywhere else...

Daniel Gettel: I think the access to Route 55 makes a lot of sense. I don't see why they would be opposed to it. It's not your main entrance. Any questions from the board?

Michael Weeks: Let me just go over one of the other comments I had. I think they should provide a narrative of some of the stuff Jess talked about tonight, in terms of public uses, and what is available for use by the public, and what guests use. Just so that we are clear. In reviewing some of the supporting documentation, I don't know if the banquet facility is only just for guests, if you want to have a party you could, etc .

Daniel Gettel: We were led to believe in the past that it would be open for weddings for the public.

Jess Sudol: It is something that I will put together, and give a very detail explanation. Certainly, this board is owed that.

Michael Weeks: For BJ's and everyone's point of view, to know what the intent of the use is.

Susan Brown Otto: I have a comment on the sign. Secondly, the fire department and gates, I know with the gated communities, they always have problems with their gates. And the fire department has

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

problems getting in the gate, especially when the power is out, Dave (Slater), they have problem getting into Kenoza Lake Estates, right?

David Slater: Yes.

Susan Brown Otto: I don't know when the power goes out, are the gates operated by power?

Jess Sudol: There actually will be emergency generators that operate, not the full facility, but will keep emergency type stuff like the water flowing, mobile lighting. Actually the fire department mentioned some of those issues that they had, and we basically said what would you want, and we will give it to you. They came up with a gate card, and now that they have a gate card.

Susan Brown Otto: Good. The other thing has to do with the dumpsters and bears. Bears are in the vicinity.

Jess Sudol: We will have an enclosure with two doors, and security lighting.

Daniel Gettel: The dumpsters will be located near the Mansion building. It is not going to be a view from the road.

Bill Brey: The rooms will be for sale to the public, and the owner will own the facility, correct?

Jess Sudol: Yes.

Daniel Gettel: As we discussed before, the ownership is not really an issue for this board.

Jacqueline Ricciani: You need to know the overall project so you know what to expect is coming.

Jess Sudol: The owner is going to own everything. It gets more complicated.

David Biren: When this first came to this board originally 4 years ago, they said Bethel residents could buy membership to the gym, and he promised that. I would like to see that maintained.

Jess Sudol: Okay.

Daniel Gettel: It was something that was mentioned. It is still an option we would like to pursue.

Jacqueline Ricciani: They changed their approach. If this is going to be for people for health reasons, it could be like a cardiac rehab, and that kind of thing, it might not be the gym you are anticipating. They may not have spinning.....

David Biren: I would like to have that option available to residents.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Jacqueline Ricciani: I think that will be included in the narrative that Michael requested as far as what is available to the public.

Daniel Gettel: I can also understand that the clientele wants to remain private, and that it wouldn't be open to the public. I can understand both sides.

Jacqueline Ricciani: And it would only be available to guests, and that would make sense.

Susan Brown Otto: There is a swimming pool, right? Indoor?

Jess Sudol: Yes, but outdoor.

BJ Gettel: This project is subject to a 239, both state and county. Is the board comfortable with the information that you have that I can pursue?

Daniel Gettel: I think we should talk about our comfort level. We discussed before the meeting during the work session with the information we have now whether or not it is a complete application. I think Jacy would agree that the information we have now is a complete application. So we could consider granting you a public hearing next month, or the month after, whatever you are more comfortable with. But you are also taking a risk that if you have to make a site plan change, we would need to have a second public hearing.

Jess Sudol: I understand that risk.

Daniel Gettel: Are you willing to take that risk, and Jacy are you okay with this?

Jacqueline Ricciani: It is up to the applicant.

Daniel Gettel: We are not talking about adding a dumpster, but substantial changes.

Jess Sudol: Not that I anticipate anything substantial, should anything come up, who would be responsible for making that call?

Jacqueline Ricciani: The board. The board will determine whether the change is substantial or not, and whether or not a second public hearing is required.

Jess Sudol: Again, I don't see this changing.

Jacqueline Ricciani: With everything that has been discussed, The SWPPP plan seems to be the primary concern, and I don't think that is going to change the overall project.

Daniel Gettel: Michael, were there any substantial findings in the traffic impact study? I agree that when there is a concert at Bethel Woods, every intersection in Bethel is a problem. There is no good

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

level of service when there is a concert.

Michael Weeks: A hotel is not going to affect the traffic on Route 17B when there is a concert.

Jacqueline Ricciani: I bet the facility would provide shuttle service, which would decrease.....

Daniel Gettel: We are not going to find anything substantial.

Michael Weeks: I had some comments on the trip generation for the facility, and that relates to my other comment about defining, but that is not going to affect the bottom line.

Daniel Gettel: Any other questions. BJ, are you going to need a narrative from the applicant in order for you to do your 239 submissions?

BJ Gettel: No. I am going to talk directly to Jess. Some will be mailed directly to the county; they will go to the division of planning. They need the formal form. The State DOT has already been in communication with them, they just need a formal form stating that the public hearing has been set. The school district, it will not affect them. I need the minimum amount of information to send to them. The Department of Health, they can send the 239.

Daniel Gettel: I used to do submissions for 239, and I used to do a narrative. I don't see why you wouldn't do a narrative.

BJ Gettel: It's up to what the board wants.

Daniel Gettel: If you are going to do a narrative for this board, you might want to do a blanket..... You don't want someone taking a fresh look and looking at the site plan and someone saying what is going on here. I feel there should be some kind of narrative.

Jess Sudol: When is the August board date?

Jacqueline Ricciani: The 2nd Tuesday.

Jess Sudol: Would it be helpful a couple of weeks before that meeting, if I make sure I have all of the revised materials in to the town staff including the response letter?

Jacqueline Ricciani: 14 days before.

Daniel Gettel: We won't have any 239 information back, that won't be back in time for a public hearing.

BJ Gettel: I have to give them 30 days.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Jacqueline Ricciani: We could always start the hearing and hold it open.

BJ Gettel: The other thing, for arguments sake, if you close the public hearing in August.....

Daniel Gettel: I don't think that is something that will affect the public hearing.

Michael Weeks: I would expect major comments from the county.

David Biren: Especially with the hydrants.

Daniel Gettel: Yes we should start the 239 as soon as possible. Do you want to risk having a public hearing in August, knowing that we will not have the 239's back, and knowing that we will be lacking information for that public hearing, and probably won't be able to close it until September?

Jess Sudol: To me August is more than 30 days.

BJ Gettel: The sooner you get the information to me.....

Daniel Gettel: Your submission really dictates the time line. If you feel you can get the information to BJ in time, I would suggest a narrative, but it is not required. A site plan is required.

Jess Sudol: It is all available.

Jacqueline Ricciani: The blasting plan is something we are going to want to see as part of SEQRA. That's going to be a big deal. Mr. Chairman, Mike (Weeks) and I were talking and it might make more sense to just wait until September to schedule the public hearing that way everything will be back. You won't need to appear here in August, whatever comments we get in, I'm sure BJ could forward to you. I just have a feeling you will be back in September anyway. Why not just do it all at once?

Jess Sudol: If it can all be done at once, I am comfortable with that.

Jacqueline Ricciani: I just don't think it can all be done at once in August.

Daniel Gettel: I agree we can't open a public hearing in August, and close in August, because we won't have all of the information back.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Why don't we just take the pressure off, let the applicant do a good thorough job, address everything and put it on in September.

Motion to grant public hearing for September 11th, with the idea that the applicant is going to proceed now with the 239 and other reviews, by David Biren, second by Steve Simpson

All in favor – 7

Opposed –0

Agreed and carried

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

2) *Application for an expansion of a summer camp located at 212 Mount Hope Road, Swan Lake, known as Bethel Tax Map #: 8-1-3.2, Malche Yisroel, Inc. aka Camp Kasho. (Adler).*

Chris Brunjes: For the record, should I go over a brief description of the camp?

Daniel Gettel: Basically I think what we are interested in is if there are any changes from last month, what you've added to the plan, what you discovered, and things of that nature.

Chris Brunjes: Updates to the site map. I have shown the existing emergency access exists, which runs along the northern side of the main residences. It goes up all the way to the 20,000 gallon storage tank, for the potable water, that is up in the top corner. It also loops around the back and heads to the dormitory that was built in April 2009, or at least it was proposed. The proposed dormitory again will be the same size and layout as the one already proposed. It will be placed east of the road.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Did you say the proposed dorm has been previously approved but not built?

Chris Brunjes: Yes. The proposed dormitory of 2009 had been proposed and built. It is sitting up there. And the proposed dormitory, it hasn't been built yet. Our office is still going over the layouts to make sure the building meets all the current 2010 building codes.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Is this to scale? The proposed looks smaller.

Chris Brunjes: Yes. You will notice to the right of the proposed dormitory, we are suggesting what the fire department knows as an alternate to the hammerhead turn around. It will allow the emergency vehicles to back up into that spot and then turn around to head down as opposed to putting in a roundabout. Unfortunately, due to the topography in the area, they can't cut straight down past units 8 & 7, 14 & 13, so it would be more convenient to put in this turnaround area. This will have no parking. It will be strictly for emergency vehicles to turn around in. Also, I put in all of the utilities, the water and sewer lines that are running throughout the camp. I put more detail in the existing septic system, the three sand filters, the components of it, the 20,000 gallon septic tank, all of the chambers. These were designed by IES, not by our office. The chief concerns from the board from the last meeting were in regards to the population of the camp. The first item was the population for summer and based on the previous summer. We do have those numbers for the board. There are 70 adults, includes all staff, kitchen staff, and those that are on site, 59 young children, infants and kids generally to young to really be a part of the camp, but are there with their parents who are staying in the units, 178 campers, to stay at the camp for the summer. Two groups that were mentioned were campers that are only there on the first and last weekend, as explained at the previous meeting. These are children who are coming up with their family on the first and last weekend, but after those weekends they are going off to other local camps. So they are only onsite for those weekends. The final group is visitors. Those kids coming from other camps just to visit and those are numbers on the high side would be around 43 – 50. That is projecting highly.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Jacqueline Ricciani: What was the number of the other group?

Chris Brunjes: 34 campers will be there on the first and last weekend. For the remainder of the summer they will be at other camps.

Jacqueline Ricciani: And the visitors number?

Chris Brunjes: 43, high 50. That is projecting highly.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Do you have a daily average of any given day you can expect about 40 to 50 visitors?

David Taub: These are day campers. They all sleep on site.

Chris Brunjes: In our calculations to determine the maximum load of the entire camp with the existing utilities, we are also factoring in those day campers, as being there for the full 24 hours, just in case of an emergency, if a bus break down. That brings during the day, regular operation, 350 individuals. We reverse calculated the existing system, the potable water, and the septic system to see what the maximum capacity is just for those two systems, to see what they can handle, because there were some questions of whether or not the system can handle it, and the additional load of the proposed classrooms, the two to three classrooms, and bedrooms, basically the units on the southwest side of Mt. Hope Road, (we were proposing also connecting those units into the system), from reverse calculating, I don't know if the board would actually like to see, or go over the calculations, but our office has. We can state that 450 people can be supplied by the potable water, and still meet the Department of Health standard of 30 minute contact time. The septic system can hold 434 people. The existing camp only has 350, even assuming that all of them are staying during the day, not including the 43 day campers, is 80%, so they can still add 80 more people and still the system can comfortably hold those loads.

Daniel Gettel: Are you using a blanket number for the adults and the kids?

Chris Brunjes: We are using a standard Department of Health number. Their standard is 50 gallons per day per person. But because most of the buildings have energy saving efficient devices to reduce water flow, we actually get a 10-gallon per day credit. I use the blanket number of 40 gallons per day that includes kitchen loads, shower, bathrooms, and laundry. That is also including the infants, and assuming all infants are using a full adults day of water.

Daniel Gettel: The campers themselves are fed through a program, so the food is brought in. They have less of a flow. The units have a kitchen, so they have a substantially higher flow than any of the campers.

Chris Brunjes: We have used it in the past with the Department of the Health that includes if they were to have their own private kitchens.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Jacqueline Ricciani: Do we need our engineer to take a look at some of these?

Daniel Gettel: The information was submitted... I asked for a report on it. I haven't seen anything in writing as far as what numbers you are using. I don't think you can use the same number for campers that you do for a unit. I mean, unit #40, however many bedrooms it may have it probably has a higher flow than the same number of kids in the dormitory. I would like our engineer to look at it, because I don't feel that is true. I would like to see that in writing. I would like to look into that. I asked Randy Wasson about it (planning board engineer). It seems to me that the unit flows would be much different than the flows from the dormitory. You are actually cooking and cleaning in the units.

Chris Brunjes: We can update those numbers, but again I was using what we used in the past. If the board would like a more exact numbers, we can provide that. Still with the loads we do feel that it should be comfortable to satisfy the existing population. Again to clarify, this proposed dormitory would not be increasing the existing population, it would just be redistributing ones that are already there.

Daniel Gettel: I did speak to Randy Wasson before the meeting. One thing that Randy did suggest, we keep going back and forth about the number of people, the population. We talked last month about how we were going to use the sewer flows and work it backwards, which is what I prefer, or we were going to talk about what population we have this year, and use that number. I suggest that you actually put a chart on the map, so that BJ can actually follow it. That Unit 26 is a 3-bedroom unit, that there are 14 people living in it. BJ, would you agree that if you had unit numbers with an actual population breakdown, that that would be helpful in the future?

BJ Gettel: Yes.

Daniel Gettel: I think that is something we would like you to add to the site plan. If you end up with a number of 434 people, which you say your sewer flow will accommodate that's great. If you can come up with a population that says unit #20 has so many people in it, and that is an actual residential unit, and Randy agrees with us, and Randy agrees with you that your sewer flow for that unit is correct, and he agrees that your flows are correct, I don't have an issue with the population. I do want a certain number that we can lock in, and say this is the number of people here. We are hearing that everybody has different numbers, and it is a concern. I'm not putting you on the spot. You say you are not increasing the population. What do we do next year when we go back? We're not going to do a head county every year of how many people are there. The health department says you have 600 people living there. You are telling us 400, BJ counts 500 beds. That is what our concern is. We are talking substantial differences. I heard there are 81 cribs at this place, which is fine if that is true. Where are you going to put them? Those kids are not going to the dormitory for another 13 years. My concern really is that we don't have anything that says in these units there are x number of people, except for the fact that we talked about the number of beds. BJ did provide us with a list today from her inspection from last month, where dorm A has 29 beds, some units have 8 beds, some have 2 beds, some have 10 beds. There is a real range. We would like to see the range brought back to a population, and if that population is something that we can enforce. What is stopping you from having 600 people next year?

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

The thing is the health department is really the issue. We don't have control over that and without something enforceable, setting a population on a property, we don't have anything to enforce. We need something in writing on an actual plan. Randy also suggested that you look more at the site plan requirements. I don't necessarily have a problem with the site plan, because we did ask you to look at the special use procedures. As long as you addressed the special use procedures, I am okay with that. I don't need topography of the whole camp to know that the classroom is going to be 100 ft off the road. It isn't necessary. As far as buffer zones, there is nothing next to the classroom. I have been by the property. I agree with what you said about the parking. I went by opening weekend. There were only 2 or 3 cars there. Parking is not an issue at this camp. We keep coming back to a population that we can't enforce.

David Taub: At last months meeting, you asked for an exact number of people that were there last year. The way I did it was, the amount of beds in each unit, I asked each family of each bungalow, and asked them which kids were participating at the camp, which kids were in different camps, which kids were there the first and last weekend. The total number that I got, the numbers that I had I went through. In my bungalow there are 9 beds, in my bungalow I have 3 kids that are there for the first and last weekend during the season. During the season there are 3 empty beds. I went to each bungalow. I went to each family, to tell me exactly how many kids go to this camp. BJ counted the beds the way she saw it. The numbers should match. I think I have come up with an accurate number.

Daniel Gettel: Can you provide us with more information on the actual? Your number is the 334?

David Taub: The most people we had on premises. My total was 350.

Daniel Gettel: Chris, did you say that the sewage disposal system would accommodate 334 people.

Chris Brunjes: No, 434 people.

Daniel Gettel: As far as I'm concerned if your sewer will accommodate.... You are not having any violations if your sewer is accommodating 434. That is the number that seems to be in the middle of all the other numbers I'm hearing. Do you understand my concern?

David Taub: To satisfy that concern we have a counter that counts how many gallons we use per day. We shouldn't overcrowd. Is it for the water and sewer? I have to submit to the DEC anyway.

Daniel Gettel: I am comfortable if you can justify if you are not over You don't have a population greater than what your septic system will accommodate. That is what my concern is over a health point of view. The health department must have written a confirmation letter before the system was built. They must have a number. If they quote 600 people.....that is the problem that we are having. We don't have anything in writing.

David Taub: What about the inspection BJ did?

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Daniel Gettel: We just got BJ's numbers tonight, but I want you to understand what our problem is.

David Taub: In actuality, we have the department of health. We have an inspection every other summer. It is very tough when we go through this inspection, and you see so many beds in the bungalows.

Daniel Gettel: Are you comfortable with giving us, as Randy suggested, a chart on the map, bldg #1 is such and such a building, and there are so many people living there. The number of bedrooms and number of people in each so we have something we can turn to and next year we can turn to you and say there should be 29 less kids? Where did those kids come from? We are getting all kinds of mixed numbers. We are not talking a dozen kids; we are talking hundreds of kids.

David Taub: A head count you will not get more than 350. The bed count I have in my bungalow, I have 3 beds in my bungalow that aren't used.

Daniel Gettel: We are talking number of bedrooms, and number of people staying in each unit. Not necessarily the number of beds. If you have a 2 bedroom unit with 23 people staying in it, that is an issue.

Jacqueline Ricciani: We need something in writing.

Daniel Gettel: Number of bedrooms, and number of people.

David Taub: How would that satisfy?

BJ Gettel: In other words you said units #7 and #8, it is supposed to be a duplex for a family. Instead, you converted it into a dormitory. That is not permitted. That is why they need to know the size and the number of people.

David Taub: That is why we want to build the new dormitory.

David Biren: How many are in each unit anyway?

Chris Brunjes: From my count, units 7 and 8 have 3 bedrooms, 6 regular beds and 1 bunk bed, when I did a walk through of the building.

BJ Gettel: I came up with 15.

Daniel Gettel: My point, we need something on the plan that locks you into a number that we can all live with, and it doesn't increase your sewer capacity, it doesn't negatively impact your sewer or water. I think that is what we are looking for. Something we can hold you to. So you come back next year, and BJ says there is x number of people here, you say dormitory people aren't going to increase the population, we can't enforce that unless we know what the population is. Do you cook in the units?

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

David Taub: We cook on premises.

Daniel Gettel: Most people eat in the dining room?

David Taub: A few families don't eat in the dining room.

Daniel Gettel: These aren't full bungalows where the people have full kitchens?

David Taub: They do have kitchens, but they don't cook.

Daniel Gettel: That is the question I have with the sewer flows. If Randy agrees that the actual adult population can be accounted for, the same way the campers are accounted for, I can't really question that. That is something that Randy needs to tell us. We need some kind of report to go to Randy in time for him to review it.

David Biren: How many kitchens you have also.

Daniel Gettel: I imagine most of the original units have kitchens. Just assume each unit has a kitchen.

Chris Brunjes: There only a few of them where it evident. They ripped out the kitchen, took out all of the cabinets and all appliances. Not all have their own kitchen.

Daniel Gettel: Again, something in writing on the plan, the number of units, number of bedrooms, and number of people. Work backwards; I'm okay with that as long as we have something to enforce. I also mentioned that we were given the fire and safety inspection. I realize that BJ just typed this up. A lot of the units are in need of repair. Have any repairs been made this year? There are a substantial amount of electric violations.

David Taub: A lot of repairs have been made. Our electrician did not have time to fix all of them.

Daniel Gettel: BJ, this isn't necessarily something that this is just being enforced now. Is it something new in the code or has it always been a problem?

BJ Gettel: It has always been a problem.

Daniel Gettel: So, this isn't something new. Classrooms 1, 2, 3, 4 – ceilings are collapsing. They need to be fixed before the season.

David Taub: The smoke detectors have been corrected. Most of the violations that we were able to fix were fixed. Three years ago we had the first electrical inspection. I believe the camp didn't go backwards, the camp only went forward.

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Daniel Gettel: That was the impression I was given at the last meeting that you have been moving in the right direction. Our concern is that how do we grant you approval to construct a new building?

David Taub: Anybody that walks into the dormitory we had built a few years ago sees it has no violations. When an inspector walks into the new building it is good. We want to put the kids in the safest place possible. We want to do that.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Are they occupied this summer? (7 & 8)

David Taub: Yes.

Daniel Gettel: BJ, do you feel if you went to the site again, provide them with this list, would you see a substantial change with this list?

BJ Gettel: I don't know. I'll make an appointment to go out, and go next week.

Daniel Gettel: Are you opposed to having BJ go out and revisit? I would like to know there is progress?

Jacqueline Ricciani: And the porches that seem to be unstable.

Daniel Gettel: Most of what is on here are things that should be corrected. Electrical problems, the stability of buildings, porches that have collapsed, mold in the units. A lot of the things should be taken care of it.

David Taub: I will make a list.

Daniel Gettel: Would you be willing to have someone meet BJ at the property?

David Taub: There is no hiding. We are an open book.

Daniel Gettel: I hope you understand our position, as far as the violations go, and the information you provided. You are asking us to let you expand which I appreciate. There is also a benefit to letting you build new. I understand, and I appreciate the fact that you want to build new and get the people out of these units. I hope you understand our position.

David Taub: The only thing is that to show the corrections, the thing is, it is what it is. There is no hiding.

Daniel Gettel: As far as moving forward, it is pretty clear we want a better break down on the population where these people are actually staying. I am hesitate to move forward without seeing that, and as far as this list goes with the safety inspection, I would like to know that there is some kind of progress being made. If you are talking about a ceiling collapsing it is only a drop ceiling that is a

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

simple fix, if that was fixed I am fine with that. Electrical is another thing, collapsing porches another thing, if this has been neglected over the years and you are asking us to let you expand.

David Taub: We can still correct.

Daniel Gettel: I am not expecting you to come back to the board and say everything is corrected, and it is now a beautiful camp. I want to know that there is some kind of progress being made, to rectify the problems we have here. Unfortunately, if we don't ask you to do it now, this is our leverage.

Steve Simpson: What is the time line for construction and for the new dormitory?

David Taub: We want to generate an interest. We want the campers to go home and say the camp is going to expand, and perhaps get some people to pay some money for that.

Steve Simpson: That makes sense, in addition to that if your customers see you making repairs to the existing structures, what I am saying is that if you put all of your resources towards the existing, you still have word of mouth the dormitory is in process, it is a project that is upcoming. At least you can repair your existing structures now and then go ahead full-blown next year. Or when you are done with the repairs, start your project, come back and we will see that things are done. I can't see you splitting up your resources, building your dorm to show the folks that this is what is coming but we still have a mess behind you. To me it would be a big investment. To me it would show that there is an interest, show an interest in the future. It isn't our call. It is in the safety of the families.

David Taub: We want the campers to sleep in one big room. We want them to have the camp experience. We have been going back and forth, do we build new, so it is not used, just fix it up.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Are these families going to donate money for the building?

David Taub: No,

Jacqueline Ricciani: This is for the campers?

David Taub: Just for the campers.

Jacqueline Ricciani: It sounds like you are going to be marketing for more campers, and you say you are not going to be changing the population.

Daniel Gettel: He's trying to generate interest in his own campers.

Jacqueline Ricciani: You have a target audience. It sounds like you are trying to encourage more people.

David Taub: Just current people. We have a couple of bungalows condemned, we would want someone

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

to use them, so I need to have someone come in and fix it up. I never got the person to put the funds in. When I talk about a new bungalow, they say lets talk. We have to generate ourselves. All the repairs done the last 2 or 3 years have been from our own funds. That new bunk, we had someone donate that, most of it.

Jacqueline Ricciani: So you are expecting families to just contribute money for the new dorm. I don't understand why they are going to give you money.

David Taub: We want someone that has money to give a donation, from the families that have kids in our school.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Ok. I get that.

Daniel Gettel: We are still stuck on population. We want a chart on the plan.

Chris Brunjes: You want current number of bedrooms in each unit, how it is being used, and total of people staying overnight.

Daniel Gettel: And justify that number you can live with and that it doesn't exceed the sewer flows. Get it to Randy 14 days prior to the meeting. That gives me the chance to look at it, and BJ to submit to the other board members. I don't know when the information came in. Randy implied he just received it. Also talk to BJ, to go to the site.

David Taub: If we have a little more time to fix things.

BJ Gettel: You could be fixing now.

Daniel Gettel: You are obviously not going to be constructing this year. If you want to delay, as I told the last applicant, your submissions dictate the timetable, if you are not ready for next meeting, or you don't think there is any progress, then don't go to the next meeting. You can always come back in September, or November, or December. It is really up to you guys, if you want more time. I think you understand our position, just let BJ know when you want to be back on the agenda, and whenever you get back on the agenda make sure you submit everything 2 weeks in advance.

BJ Gettel: I need a submission by August 1st.

Daniel Gettel: BJ needs to be out there prior to our meeting.

David Taub: Next meeting is a public hearing?

Daniel Gettel: We need a complete application to set a public hearing. The population breakdowns are what we need on the map. We need something concrete in writing, in report form. Preferably put on the map. We get that, and Randy is okay with it, we move to a public hearing. We need number of

Town of Bethel
Planning Board

PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

bedrooms and number of units.

Jacqueline Ricciani: Taking into account the new dormitory, we need to see what their proposal is.

Daniel Gettel: You gave us the number, where are the people?

David Taub: Okay.

Chris Brunjes: Even if I were to have all of this information ready by the end of the week...

Daniel Gettel: We have to review it prior to setting a public hearing. We have to have it in hand. We can't set a public hearing without that information. When does camp close?

David Taub: In August. Next meeting we will know when the public hearing is set.

Susan Brown Otto: Anything new with the town board?

Vicky Vassmer Simpson: Tomorrow night we are presenting a resolution that would accept the map plan report on the previous project, the Mansion House, to accept them in the sewer district, and set up a public hearing for that. That is on the agenda for tomorrow.

Susan Brown Otto: I have another comment I would like to share with the board. It has something to do with the cell phone towers, and it has to do with the photos submitted, the cell phone tower at the Boy Scout camp, and also the photo for the cell phone tower at Bethel Woods. I just want to say that remembering when the photos were submitted and the applicant saying that you couldn't see the cell phone tower from Route 55, and Dr. Duggan Road, and from the Iroquois Hunting Camp and what have you. Guess what, you can see the cell phone tower. You have this beautiful skyline, beautiful trees, and then you have this metal thing sticking out on the horizon. That is the only thing that sticks out on the horizon, the cell phone tower that is also not complete, also likewise when you are on Pucky Huddle Road, and you are looking over toward Bethel Woods, there you see the cell phone tower as well. I just think that if in fact you can envision that being a pine tree, it would be better for the environment. So I just wanted to go on the record. I think the photos that were submitted for the cell phone towers for the boy scouts, they were just taken in opposite direction, saying you can't see the cell phone tower, when in fact you can see the cell phone tower.

Motion to adjourn by David Biren, second by Steve Simpson

All in favor – 7

Opposed – 0

Agreed and carried

Respectively submitted,

Jannetta MacArthur

Town of Bethel
Planning Board
PO Box 300, 3454 Route 55
White Lake, NY 12786

Recording Secretary